

Obligation and Commitment in Family Law

Gillian Douglas

• H A R T •

OXFORD • LONDON • NEW YORK • NEW DELHI • SYDNEY

HART PUBLISHING

M22757

Bloomsbury Publishing Plc

Kemp House, Chawley Park, Cumnor Hill, Oxford, OX2 9PH, UK

HART PUBLISHING, the Hart/Stag logo, BLOOMSBURY and the Diana logo are trademarks of Bloomsbury Publishing Plc

First published in Great Britain 2018

Copyright © Gillian Douglas, 2018

Gillian Douglas has asserted her right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 to be identified as Author of this work.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers.

While every care has been taken to ensure the accuracy of this work, no responsibility for loss or damage occasioned to any person acting or refraining from action as a result of any statement in it can be accepted by the authors, editors or publishers.

All UK Government legislation and other public sector information used in the work is Crown Copyright ©. All House of Lords and House of Commons information used in the work is Parliamentary Copyright ©. This information is reused under the terms of the Open Government Licence v3.0 (<http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/version/3>) except where otherwise stated.

All Eur-lex material used in the work is © European Union,
<http://eur-lex.europa.eu/>, 1998–2018.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Names: Douglas, Gillian, author.

Title: Obligation and commitment in family law / Gillian Douglas.

Description: Oxford [UK] ; New York : Hart Publishing, 2018. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017052960 (print) | LCCN 2017055287 (ebook) | ISBN 9781782258537 (Epub) | ISBN 9781782258520 (hardback : alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Domestic relations—Great Britain. | Parent and child (Law)—Great Britain. | Family policy—Great Britain.

Classification: LCC KD750 (ebook) | LCC KD750 .D69 2018 (print) | DDC 346.4101/5—dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2017052960>

ISBN: HB: 978-1-78225-852-0

ePDF: 978-1-78225-854-4

ePub: 978-1-78225-853-7

Typeset by Compuscript Ltd, Shannon

Printed and bound in Great Britain by TJ International Ltd, Padstow, Cornwall

To find out more about our authors and books visit www.hartpublishing.co.uk.

Here you will find extracts, author information, details of forthcoming events and the option to sign up for our newsletters.

Contents

<i>Preface</i>	v
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xv
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xxi
1. The Ties that Bind?	1
I. Introduction	1
II. Care and Caring	4
A. An 'Ethic of Care'	4
B. Meanings of 'Care'	5
III. Legal Obligation	8
A. Obligation as Duty	8
B. Obligation as Remedy	11
C. The Nature of Family Obligation	12
IV. Obligation as a Social Norm	15
V. The Concept of Commitment	18
A. Commitment in Legal Discourse	18
B. Commitment in Family Law Policy	22
C. Commitment as a Social Concept	23
VI. The Rationale for Obligations Upon Family Members	28
A. Causation	29
B. Mutual Commitment	30
C. Relationship-generated Loss and Gain	31
VII. Obligation or Commitment	32
2. Family Change and Individual Commitment	35
I. Family Changes	35
II. A Demographic Picture	36
A. Forming 'a Family'	37
B. Birth and Family Size	42
C. Households	45
D. The Ending of Relationships	45
E. Lone-parent Families	49
F. Economic Activity	51
III. From the Family to the Individual	59
A. Form, Role and Gender	59

xii *Contents*

B. Capitalism and Family Function.....	60
C. Individualism and Individualisation	64
IV. Change and Commitment.....	68
3. To Have and To Hold.....	70
I. Compelling Cohabitation	70
II. The Concept of Consortium	71
III. The Suit for Restitution of Conjugal Rights.....	76
A. The Basis of the Action	76
B. The Ostensible Purpose of the Decree	78
C. The Effect of the Decree after 1884.....	82
D. The Tactical use of the Suit.....	85
E. Abolition of the Suit.....	90
IV. The Modern 'Duty' of Cohabitation.....	94
V. Marriage as Personal Commitment	96
4. A Clean Break	98
I. A Duty to Maintain.....	98
II. Maintenance During Marriage	99
A. A Direct Right to Seek Maintenance	100
B. Is there Still an Obligation to Maintain a Spouse During Marriage?.....	104
III. Post-Divorce Maintenance and the Clean Break	106
A. Financial Remedies before the Matrimonial Proceedings and Property Act 1970.....	106
B. Assessment of Maintenance.....	108
C. The Modern Law	114
IV. Triumph of the Clean Break?.....	128
5. Can't Pay? Won't Pay!.....	130
I. Duty to State, Mother or Child?.....	130
II. Limiting the Burden on the State	131
A. The Poor Law	131
B. The Problem of 'Bastardy'.....	133
III. Protecting the Position of Mothers	134
A. The Direct Claim for Maintenance.....	134
B. Quantum.....	137
C. Provision for Children Born Outside Marriage.....	141
D. Duration of Provision for Children	145
IV. Supporting the Child	146
A. Replacing the Courts.....	146
B. Reforming Child Support	151
C. Family-based Arrangements	154
D. Collection and Enforcement	157
V. A Culture of Non-Compliance	159

6. Parenthood is for Life	161
I. Obligation or Right?	161
II. Paternal Right and Maternal Concession	164
A. The Purpose and Benefits of a Custody or Access Order.....	165
B. The Welfare of the Child.....	167
III. A Right of Both Parents	168
A. Splitting Rights	170
IV. A Right of the Child	172
A. Access and the Welfare of the Child.....	174
V. A Parental Responsibility	176
A. A Duty to Facilitate Contact	177
B. 'Implacable Hostility' or Legitimate Fear?	178
C. Contact and Commitment	180
VI. Enforcing Contact.....	181
A. Enforcing an Obligation to Allow Contact	181
B. Enforcing an Obligation to Maintain Contact?.....	185
VII. A Presumption of Continuing Parental Involvement	186
A. 'Involvement'	188
VIII. An Obligation to be 'Involved'?	190
7. Who Cares?	192
I. Care-Giving as an Obligation	192
II. Care-Giving as a Claim to a Remedy	194
A. Care as Contribution in a Marriage.....	197
B. Care, Commitment and Cohabitation.....	201
III. Caring Relationships.....	207
A. What is Meant by 'Caring'?	209
B. What is a Caring 'Relationship'?.....	213
C. The Rationale for Recognition.....	217
IV. Recognition of Caring Relationships, or Recognition of Care?	219
8. The Law of Family Obligations	222
I. Care, Obligation and Commitment.....	222
II. Altruism, Family Obligation and Non-Justiciability	224
A. Family Morality and Religious Duty.....	224
B. Law Reform and Obligation	226
C. The Sphere of the Emotions.....	228
III. The Gendered Legal Approach to the Family Unit	231
IV. Obligations and Commitments in Family Law	235
A. Laissez-faire Family Law?	237
B. Remedial Family Law	240

xiv *Contents*

C. Caring Relationships	243
D. 'Family-based' Remedies.....	245
V. Obligation <i>and</i> Commitment	246
 <i>Bibliography</i>	249
<i>Index</i>	265